

## STATE OF NEW JERSEY

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION
OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of Enzo Gencarelli, Sheriff's Officer Captain (PC2630V), Passaic County

**Examination Appeal** 

CSC Docket No. 2019-644

ISSUED: OCTOBER 18, 2018 (ABR)

Enzo Gencarelli appeals the multiple choice portion of the promotional examination for Sheriff's Officer Captain (PC2630V), Passaic County.

The subject examination was administered on July 26, 2018 and consisted of 50 multiple choice questions and one essay question.

The appellant's appeal involves Question 23 on the subject examination, which is based upon an Employee Recognition Program Policy that is outlined for multiple test questions. Four of the Employee Recognition Programs described in the examination are an Employee of the Quarter Award, a Minimal Sick Leave Usage Award, a Customer Service Award and an Outstanding Employee Award. The reward for the Employee of the Quarter Award is \$200 in cash plus eight hours of employee recognition leave. The prize for the Minimal Sick Leave Usage Award is \$150 in cash. Customer Service Award candidates are evaluated on nine criteria. Winners of that award can receive up to \$200 in cash and eight hours of employee recognition leave. Customer Service Award winners who meet between one or two of the criteria receive \$100; those who meet three to five criteria earn \$150; and those meeting six or more criteria receive \$200. A recipient of the Outstanding Employee Award may receive up to \$500 cash and 16 hours of employee recognition leave, based upon how many of the criteria out of 11 they meet. A winner satisfying between one and four of the criteria for the Outstanding Employee Award receives \$200. Higher awards are offered to Outstanding Employee Award winners who meet five or more criteria.

Question 23 indicates that "Sergeant Talbot receives a \$200 cash award" and asks candidates which of the following statements "could be true" based upon the Employee Recognition Program:

- I. Sergeant Talbot receives the Employee of the Quarter Award
- II. Sergeant Talbot receives the Minimal Sick Leave Usage Award
- III. Sergeant Talbot met five of the criteria for the Customer Service Award
- IV. Sergeant Talbot met three of the criteria for the Outstanding Employee Award

The keyed response is option b, "I and IV only." The appellant argues option d, "I, III and IV only" is the best response. Specifically, the appellant argues that if Sergeant Talbot received \$200 for meeting six or more out of the nine Customer Service Award criteria, then he had technically "met five of the criteria for the Customer Service Award." Thus, it "could be true" that he "met five of the criteria for the Customer Service Award" and received \$200.

## CONCLUSION

In the instant matter, the pertinent issue regarding Question 23 is the interpretation of the statement "Sergeant Talbot met five of the criteria for the Customer Service Award." As noted in the 2018 Sheriff's Officer Captain Orientation Guide, candidates must "[r]eview each question carefully and select the BEST answer from the options given." It is clear that the most reasonable interpretation of that statement is that Sergeant met *exactly* five out of the nine criteria. Based upon the stated structure for the Customer Service Award, a candidate who meets exactly five criteria receives \$150. Thus, statement III is not true. Further, based upon the award descriptions in the examination, it is evident that statements I and IV in are true, while statement II is not. Accordingly, the Commission finds that Question 23 is correct as keyed.

## **ORDER**

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be denied.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON THE  $17^{TH}$  DAY OF OCTOBER, 2018

Derdre' L. Webster Calib

Deirdré L. Webster Cobb

Chairperson

Civil Service Commission

Inquiries and

Correspondence

Christopher S. Myers

Director

Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs

Civil Service Commission Written Record Appeals Unit

P.O. Box 312

Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Enzo Gencarelli Michael Johnson Joseph DeNardo Records Center